# Health & Fitness Journal

# of Canada

Copyright © 2019 The Authors. Journal Compilation Copyright © 2019 Health & Fitness Society of BC

Volume 12

**September 30, 2019** 

Number 3

## STUDENTS' CORNER

Knowledge Translation of Aerobic Exercise as an Alternative Treatment for Major Depressive Disorder in Adults Jennifer Boughner<sup>1</sup> and Darren E. R. Warburton<sup>2</sup>

1 School of Kinesiology, Physical Activity Promotion and Chronic Disease Prevention Unit, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada V6T1Z3

\*Corresponding Author: jenboughner@rogers.com

#### Abstract

**Background**: Depression is a leading cause of disability globally and evaluating alternative treatments for depression and communicating results through knowledge translation resources is important. **Purpose**: This student-driven, evidence-based, review is a supplementary narrative to a knowledge translation video designed to educate the general public with regards to the use of aerobic exercise as an alternative treatment for depression in adults. **Results**: Evidence indicates that aerobic exercise is similarly as effective as pharmacotherapy or psychotherapy for the treatment of mild or moderate depression, and an effective adjunctive treatment for moderate to severe depression. **Conclusion**: The effectiveness of aerobic exercise as an alternative treatment to pharmacotherapy and psychotherapy is examined. Evidence-based dosage recommendations for patients are discussed.

Health & Fitness Journal of Canada 2019;12(3):177-182. https://doi.org/10.14288/hfjc.v12i3.281

Keywords: Physical Activity, Exercise, Kinesiology, Mental Health, Antidepressants, Mood Disorders, Psychotherapy, Knowledge Transition, Health Promotion

#### Introduction

The primary purpose of this studentdriven, narrative review and commentary is to supplement an evidence-based knowledge translation video designed to educate the general public on the use of aerobic exercise as an alternative treatment for depression in adults. Depression is a common mental disorder with 322 million people diagnosed globally and is the leading cause of disability worldwide (WHO, 2017). The central feature of major depression disorder is having either a depressed mood or loss of interest or pleasure in almost all activities, over a period of

greater than two weeks (American Psychiatric Association, 2013). Major depressive disorder (MDD) ranges in duration and severity and is diagnosed by a medical doctor (American Psychiatric Association, 2013). Depression causes a decrement to comparison to somatic diseases including angina, arthritis, asthma, and diabetes (Moussavi et al., 2007). Depression is traditionally treated through the use of antidepressant medication psychological treatments (World Health Organization, 2018). Many patients do not respond to antidepressant medication or experience negative side effects

(Blumenthal et al., 2007). No single treatment for depression is effective for every individual and as a result, alternative treatments options that are accessible and affordable have become a significant research interest (Fava et al., 2003; Brosse et al., 2002).

Exercise is structured physical activity, undertaken with the goal of increasing health or physical fitness (Cooney et al. 2013; Warburton, Nicol, & Bredin, 2006b). Both aerobic and anaerobic exercise are effective in reducing depression symptoms with no superiority between exercise forms (Stanton et al., Both physiological factors and psychological factors are cited potential mechanisms in reducing depression symptoms through exercise (Cooney et al., 2013; Craft & Perna, 2004). This narrative will present a summary for the effectiveness of aerobic exercise prescription comparison in pharmacotherapy and psychotherapy. As well as summarize the current state of knowledge on the dosage and delivery of exercise prescription for patients, as treatment for major depression disorder in adults.

#### Methods

Using the University of British Columbia's (UBC) Summon 2.0 Search Database, search terms included "aerobic exercise, treatment, depression, adults" were used to collect recent high-quality randomized control trials and systematic reviews. Results from these studies were analysed. A 90 s script and knowledge vignette translation video Videoscribe® animation technology was created. Current patients with depression and medical doctors were the target audience for this knowledge translation piece. Relevant symbolism and language

appropriate for this target audience was used.

# **Key Findings**

A large body of evidence demonstrates that people who are more physically active are less likely to have major disorder depression depressive or symptoms (Loprinzi, 2013; Goodwin, 2003; Bhui & Fletcher, 2000; Sale, Guppy, & Sayed, 2000; Dunn, Trivedi & Kampert, 2005; Wyshak, 2001). Using objective assessments of physical activity researchers found a negative correlation between depression and all levels (light to vigorous) of physical activity (Loprinzi, 2013). Low levels of physical activity during childhood were associated with increased prevalence of depression in adults (Jacka et al., 2011).

Aerobic exercise has been shown across a substantial body of research to be as effective as pharmacotherapy, psychotherapy or a combination thereof in reducing depression symptoms (Mead et al., 2009; Blumenthal et al., 1999: Rethorst et al., 2009; Blumenthal et al., 2007; Schuch et al., 2016; Babyak et al., 2000; Blumenthal, Smith, & Hoffman, 2013). A meta-analysis found that aerobic exercise is effective for the treatment of depression as both a stand-alone treatment or as a concurrent treatment pharmacotherapy and/or psychotherapy (Perraton et al., 2010; Cooney et al., 2013).

The exact mechanisms underlying the antidepressant effects of exercise remain to be fully elucidated; however, several physiological and psychological factors have been acknowledged (Cooney et al., 2013; Craft & Perna, 2004). Example proposed physiological mechanisms to explain the benefits of exercise in reducing depressive symptoms include increased release of  $\beta$ -endorphins,

increased availability of neurotransmitters, increased turnover of brain-derived neurotropic factor, increased body temperature, and a reduction in cortisol levels (Cooney et al., 2013; Craft & Perna, 2004). Psychological mechanisms include the distraction hypothesis (physical activity distracts from depressive thoughts) and increased self-efficacy (Cooney et al., 2013; Craft & Perna, 2004).

Aerobic exercise may serve as an alternative treatment for mild to moderate depression providing a viable alternative to antidepressant medication (Kvam et al., 2016; Ravidran et al., 2018). This may be particularly beneficial for patients who do not want traditional treatments, have limited financial resources, are not responding to their current treatment plan, and/or are on a wait list for treatment (Kvam et al., 2016).

Evidence for the long-term effects of exercise are less clear (Ravindran et al., 2018). The Duke SMILE study gives support for long-term benefits of aerobic exercise for depression (Babyak et al., 2000). Patients in all intervention groups (aerobic exercise, sertraline therapy, or a combination of both) experienced equal and significant improvement (Babvak et al., 2000). However, ten months after treatment completion, individuals in the exercise group had significantly reduced rates of relapse (Babyak et al., 2000). Exercising independently after treatment completion was significantly associated with lower relapse rates (Babyak et al., 2000).

Research suggests a dosage of aerobic exercise that is consistent with public health recommendations, or a total volume of 150 min/wk of moderate to vigorous activity or 1000 kcal/wk (150 to 400 kcal/d) (Dunn et al., 2005; Perraton et al., 2010; Warburton, Nicol & Bredin,

2006a). It is important to note that one systematic review found positive effects of aerobic exercise as a treatment method for depression with dosages less than public health recommendations with average dosages of 60-80% of maximum heart rate, three 30-minute sessions per week (Perraton et al., 2010). Therefore, practitioners should consider both the physical fitness unique and characteristics of the patient when interventions prescribing exercise (Ravidran et al., 2018; Warburton & Bredin, 2016).

Evidence indicates exercise should be structured and supervised by a qualified exercise professional (Perraton et al., 2010; Schuch et al., 2016). Group exercise is beneficial to enhancing the perception of enjoyment, feeling of belonging in a social context. and social support (Ranjbar et al., 2015; Gore, Farrell & Gordon, 2001). Duration of supervised exercise should be greater than 8-12 wk (Stanton & Reabum, 2014; Perraton et al., 2010). Based on the collective evidence. the Canadian Network for Mood and Anxiety Disorders concludes there is Level 1 evidence in support of the use of exercise as viable treatment for major depressive disorder with no form of exercise (aerobic versus anaerobic) superior to another (Ravidran et al., 2018; Stanton et al., 2013). Level 1 evidence is the greatest strength evidence comprised of meta-analysis with narrow confidence intervals or greater than two placebo controlled randomized control trials with adequate sample size (Ravidran et al., 2018).

Exercise is recommended as the firstline monotherapy treatment for mild to moderate MDD and as second-line adjunctive treatment for moderate to severe MDD due to inconclusive evidence on the long-term effects of exercise in reducing depression symptoms (Ravidran et al., 2018).

### Conclusion

Collectively, there is a growing body of compelling research supporting the effectiveness of aerobic exercise as an alternative or adiunctive treatment (dependent on severity level) in adults with major depressive disorder (Ravidran et al., 2018). There are currently no established exercise dosage guidelines; however, the collective research indicates an effective dosage target of 30 min/d of supervised moderate-intensity exercise, three or more times weekly for greater than 9 wk (Stanton & Reabum, 2014; Perraton et al., 2010; Nyström et al., 2015). An evidence-based dosage lower than public health recommendations has implications for health professionals in education and knowledge translation (Warburton & Bredin, 2016). Greater research is needed to further understand the dose-response relationship of aerobic exercise and reduction in depression symptoms. Additionally, future research should continue to investigate the long-term effects of aerobic exercise on depression symptoms.

### **Acknowledgements**

We would like to acknowledge that this work was conducted as part of an upper level undergraduate course at the University of British Columbia.

# **Authors' Qualifications**

The authors' qualifications are as follows: Jennifer Boughner, BKin; Darren Warburton, MSc, PhD, HFFC-CEP.

#### References

- American Psychiatric Association, American Psychiatric Association. DSM-5 Task Force, & PsychiatryOnline Premium Package. (2013). Diagnositic and statistical manual of mental disorders: DSM-5 (5th ed). Washington, D.C: American Psychiatric Association.
- Babyak, M., Blumenthal, J. A., Herman, S., Khatri, P., Doraiswamy, M., Moore, K., . . . Krishnan, K. R. (2000). Exercise treatment for major depression: Maintenance of therapeutic benefit at 10 months. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, 62(5), 633-638. doi:10.1097/00006842-200009000-00006
- Bhui, K., & Fletcher, A. (2000). Common mood and anxiety states: Gender differences in the protective effect of physical activity. Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology, 35(1), 28-35. doi:10.1007/s001270050005
- Blumenthal, J. A., Babyak, M. A., Moore, K. A., Craighead, W. E., Herman, S., Khatri, P., Krishnan, K. R. (1999). Effects of exercise training on older patients with major depression. *Archives of Internal Medicine*, 159(19), 2349-2356. doi:10.1001/archinte.159.19.2349
- Blumenthal, J. A., Smith, P. J., & Hoffman, B.M. (2012). Is exercise a viable treatment for depression? *ACSM's Health & Fitness Journal*, 16(4), 14.
- Blumenthal, J., Babyak, M., Doraiswamy, P., Watkins, L., Hoffman, B., Barbour, K., . . . Sherwood, A. (2007). Exercise and pharmacotherapy in the treatment of major depressive disorder. Psychosomatic Medicine, 69(7), 587-596. doi:10.1097/PSY.0b013e318148c19a
- Brosse, A. L., Sheets, E. S., Lett, H. S., & Blumenthal, J. A. (2002). Exercise and the Treatment of Clinical Depression in Adults. *Sports Medicine*, 32(12),741-760. doi:10.2165/00007256-200232120-00001
- Craft, L. L., & Perna, F. M. (2004). The benefits of exercise for the clinically depressed: CME. The Primary Care Companion to the Journal of Clinical Psychiatry, 6(3), 104-111. doi:10.4088/PCC.v06n0301
- Cooney, G., Dwan, K., Greig, C., Lawlor, D., Rimer, J., Waugh, F., . . . Mead, G. (2013). Exercise for depression. *Cochrane Database of*

- Systematic Reviews, (9), CD004366-CD004366.
- doi:10.1002/14651858.CD004366.pub6
- Dunn, A. L., Trivedi, M. H., Kampert, J. B., Clark, C. G., & Chambliss, H. O. (2005). Exercise treatment for depression: Efficacy and dose response. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 28(1), 1.
- Fava, M., Rush, A. J., Trivedi, M. H., Nierenberg, A. A., Thase, M. E., Sackeim, H. A., . . . for the STAR\*D Investigators Group. (2003). Background and rationale for the sequenced treatment alternatives to relieve depression (STAR\*D) study. United States: Elsevier Inc. doi:10.1016/S0193-953X(02)00107-7
- Goodwin, R. D. (2003). Association between physical activity and mental disorders among adults in the United States. *Preventive Medicine*, 36(6), 698-703. doi:10.1016/s0091-7435(03)00042-2
- Gore, S., Farrell, F., & Gordon, J. (2001). Sports involvement as protection against depressed mood. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 11(1), 119-130. doi:10.1111/1532-7795.00006
- Jacka, F. N., Pasco, J. A., Williams, L. J., Leslie, E. R., Dodd, S., Nicholson, G. C., . . . Berk, M. (2011). Lower levels of physical activity in childhood associated with adult depression. *Journal of Science and Medicine in Sport*, 14(3), 222-226. doi:10.1016/j.jsams.2010.10.458
- Kvam, S., Kleppe, C. L., Nordhus, I. H., & Hovland, A. (2016). Exercise as a treatment for depression: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, 202, 67-86. doi:10.1016/j.jad.2016.03.063
- Loprinzi, P. D. (2013). Objectively measured light and moderate- to-vigorous physical activity is associated with lower depression levels among older US adults. *Aging & Mental Health*, *17*(7), 801-805.
  - doi:10.1080/13607863.2013.801066
- Mead, G. E., Morley, W., Campbell, P., Greig, C. A., McMurdo, M., & Lawlor, D. A. (2009). Exercise for depression. *The Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, (3), CD004366.
- Moussavi, S., MPH, Chatterji, S., Dr, Verdes, E., PhD, Tandon, A., PhD, Patel, V., PhD, & Ustun, B., MD. (2007). Depression, chronic diseases, and decrements in health: Results from

- the world health surveys. Lancet, the, 370(9590), 851-858. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(07)61415-9
- Nyström, M. B. T., Neely, G., Hassmén, P., & Carlbring, P. (2015). Treating major depression with physical activity: A systematic overview with recommendations. *Cognitive Behaviour Therapy*, 44(4), 341. doi:10.1080/16506073.2015.1015440
- Perraton, L., Kumar, S., & Machotka, Z. (2010). Exercise parameters in the treatment of clinical depression: A systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice*, 16(3),597-604. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2753.2009.01188.x
- Ranjbar, E., Memari, A. H., Hafizi, S., Shayestehfar, M., Mirfazeli, F. S., & Eshghi, M. A. (2015). Depression and exercise: A clinical review and management guideline. *Asian Journal of Sports Medicine*, 6(2), e24055. doi:10.5812/asjsm.6(2)2015.24055
- Ravindran, A. V., Balneaves, L. G., Faulkner, G., Ortiz, A., Mcintosh, D., Morehouse, R. L., ... Parikh, S. V. (2018). Canadian Network for Mood and Anxiety Treatments (CANMAT) 2016 Clinical Guidelines for the Management of Adults with Major Depressive Disorder: Section Complementary Alternative and Medicine Treatments. Focus, 16(1), 85-94. doi:10.1176/appi.focus.16106
- Rethorst, C. D., Wipfli, B. M., & Landers, D. M. (2009). The antidepressive effects of exercise: A meta-analysis of randomized trials. *Sports Medicine*, *39*(6), 491-511. doi:10.2165/00007256-200939060-00004
- Sale, C., Guppy, A., & El-Sayed, M. (2000).
  Individual differences, exercise and leisure activity in predicting affective well-being in young adults. *Ergonomics*, 43(10), 1689-1697. doi:10.1080/001401300750004096
- Stanton, R., & Reaburn, P. (2013;2014;). Exercise and the treatment of depression: A review of the exercise program variables. *Journal of Science and Medicine in Sport*, 17(2), 177-182. doi:10.1016/j.jsams.2013.03.010
- Stanton, R., Reaburn, P., & Happell, B. (2013). Is cardiovascular or resistance exercise better to treat patients with depression?

  A narrative review. *Issues in Mental*

- *Health Nursing, 34*(7), 531-538. doi:10.3109/01612840.2013.774077
- Schuch, F. B., Vancampfort, D., Richards, J., Rosenbaum, S., Ward, P. B., & Stubbs, B. (2016). Exercise as a treatment for depression: A meta-analysis adjusting for publication bias. *Journal of Psychiatric Research*, 77, 42-51. doi:10.1016/j.jpsychires.2016.02.023
- Warburton, D. E., Nicol, C., & Bredin, S. S. (2006a)
  Health benefits of physical activity: the
  evidence. Canadian Medical Association
  Journal 2006;174(6):801-809. PMID:
  16534088
- Warburton, D. E., Nicol, C., & Bredin, S. S. (2006b).

  Prescribing exercise as preventive therapy. Canadian Medical Association Journal, 174(7), 961-974. URL: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/query.fcgi?cmd=Retrieve&db=PubMed&dopt=Citation&list\_uids=16567757">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/query.fcgi?cmd=Retrieve&db=PubMed&dopt=Citation&list\_uids=16567757</a>.
- Warburton, D. E. R., & Bredin, S. S. D.. (2016).
  Reflections on physical activity and health: What should we recommend? *Canadian Journal of Cardiology*, 32(4), 495-504. doi:10.1016/j.cjca.2016.01.024
- World Health Organization (2017). Depression and Other Common Mental Disorders: Global Health Estimates. Depression and Other Common Mental Disorders: Global Health Estimates (pp. 1–24). Geneva.
- World Health Organization. (2018, March 22).

  Depression. Retrieved from https://www.who.int/en/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/depression
- Wyshak, G. (2001). Womens College Physical Activity and Self-Reports of Physician-Diagnosed Depression and of Current Symptoms of Psychiatric Distress. *Journal of Womens Health & Gender-Based Medicine*, 10(4), 363-370. doi:10.1089/152460901750269689